

## **AXIS JURIS INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL**

# Website: axisjuris.com

# **OPEN ACCESS LAW JOURNAL – COPYRIGHT © 2023** EDITOR-IN-CHIEF: MR. AHMAR MOHD AFAQ AFAQ **PUBLISHER: MR. SWAHNIK MONDAL**

This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative **Commons Attribution- Non-Commercial-Share Alike 4.0 International (CC-**BY-NC-SA 4.0) License, which permits unrestricted non-commercial use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium provided the original work is properly cited.

## DISCLAIMER

Without the previous written consent of the Publishing Editor of Axis Juris International Journal, no portion of this publication may be duplicated or copied in any way. All articles submitted to this publication are owned by the author and the Axis Juris International Journal editorial team. The editorial team of Axis Juris International Journal does not agree with the views contained in this publication; these are the writers' solely personal opinions. Axis Juris International Journal makes every effort to guarantee the truth and completeness of the material presented, but it disclaims all liability for any mistakes that may arise from human error or other causes.

NTER

# EXPLORING THE INTERSECTION OF TRANSFER SYSTEMS, GOVERNMENT, AND FEMINISM IN THE INDIAN PERSPECTIVE, RESISTIVE JUSTICE IS TRANSFORMED THROUGH THE INCORPORATION OF MEDIATION

Written By- Shivvendra Singh<sup>1</sup>

Received 07 October 2023; Accepted 16 October 2023; Published 19 October 2023

### ABSTRACT

The Indian justice system has been grappling with issues of gender-based violence and discrimination for decades. Despite the existence of laws and policies aimed at protecting women's rights, implementation has been a challenge due to the complex intersection of transfer systems, government, and feminism. This paper explores how resistive justice can be transformed through the incorporation of mediation. Transfer systems refer to the mechanisms through which cases are transferred from one court or jurisdiction to another. In India, this process has often led to delays and inefficiencies in the justice system, particularly in cases of violence against women. Government policies and interventions have attempted to address these challenges, but their effectiveness has been limited by a lack of feminist perspectives and engagement. Feminism, as a political and social movement, seeks to challenge and transform patriarchal structures that perpetuate gender-based violence and inequality. In the Indian context, feminist perspectives have been instrumental in shaping legal and policy frameworks aimed at protecting women's rights. However, the implementation of these frameworks has been hindered by resistance from traditional patriarchal structures. Mediation, as a form of alternative dispute resolution, offers a transformative approach to justice that can address the challenges posed by transfer systems, government policies, and patriarchal structures. It also offers a more efficient and effective approach to justice that can reduce delays and improve outcomes for women. Through the incorporation of mediation, resistive justice can be transformed in the Indian context. This requires a feminist perspective that challenges patriarchal structures and engages

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Student under Lucknow University

with government policies and transfer systems to ensure that women's rights are protected. By prioritizing women's agency and participation in the justice system, mediation offers a transformative approach to justice that can address the complex challenges facing the Indian justice system

Keywords: Transfer system, Government, Feminism, Patriarchal Structures, Justice System.

## **INTRODUCTION**

The Indian criminal justice system has been criticized for its inefficiency and ineffectiveness in addressing the root causes of crime. The traditional approach to justice has focused on punishment, retribution, and deterrence, often at the expense of rehabilitation and restoration. However, there is growing recognition that the criminal justice system needs to be transformed to better address the underlying 'social' and 'psychological factors' that support illegal activity. One way to transform justice is through the use of mediation and resistive justice. A neutral third person mediates disputes between two or more parties by facilitating dialogue and negotiation. Resistive justice, on the other hand, is a concept that challenges the dominant narratives and power structures that underpin the criminal justice system. It seeks to empower marginalized communities and promote social justice through collective action and resistance. The intersection of transfer system, governance, and feminism with resistive justice in association with mediation can provide valuable insights into how to transform the criminal justice system in India.

## TRANSFER SYSTEM IN INDIA

The transfer system in India refers to the movement of individuals from one jurisdiction to another, such as from a juvenile court to an adult court. The lives of people who are involved in the criminal justice system can be significantly impacted by the transfer system. For example, transferring a juvenile offender to an adult court can result in harsher penalties and fewer opportunities for rehabilitation. The use of mediation in transfer cases can provide a more restorative approach to justice by allowing the parties involved to communicate and negotiate a resolution that meets everyone's needs. This can be particularly effective in cases involving juveniles, who may benefit from a more rehabilitative approach to justice.

The "Juvenile Justice (Care and Protection of Children) Act, 2015"<sup>2</sup> in India offers provisions for the social reintegration and rehabilitation of children who have run afoul of the law. The Act also mandates the use of alternative dispute resolution mechanisms, including mediation, for resolving disputes involving children.

## **GOVERNANCE IN INDIA**

Governance in India refers to the structures and processes that govern society, including the criminal justice system. The structures and processes that govern society can either promote or hinder social justice. For example, the over-reliance on punitive measures in the criminal justice system can perpetuate social inequalities and reinforce power imbalances.

The use of resistive justice in association with mediation can challenge these power structures and promote social justice by empowering marginalized communities and promoting collective action. In India, civil society organizations have played a crucial role in promoting resistive justice and challenging the dominant narratives and power structures that underpin the criminal justice system.

## FEMINISM IN INDIA

Feminism in India is a political and social movement that seeks to promote gender equality and challenge patriarchal power structures. The patriarchal power structures that underpin the criminal justice system can perpetuate gender inequality and contribute to the over-representation of women in the criminal justice system.

By challenging these power structures and promoting gender equality, feminism can help to transform the criminal justice system into a more equitable and just institution. In India, feminist organizations have played a crucial role in advocating for women's rights and promoting gender-sensitive approaches to justice.

In India, feminism has gained momentum over the years, with women fighting for their rights and challenging the traditional gender roles assigned to them. This article will explore the history of feminism in India, its challenges, and how it has evolved over the years. The Indian feminist

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Juvenile Justice (Care and Protection of Children) Act, 2015

#### **AXIS JURIS INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL**

movement dates back to the late 19th century<sup>3</sup>. The first women's organization, the 'Women's Indian Association'<sup>4</sup>, was founded in 1917 by 'Annie Besant'<sup>5</sup>, a British suffragette. The organization aimed to improve the status of women in society and promote their rights.

In the 1970s, the feminist movement gained momentum with the emergence of the women's liberation movement. Women started to challenge the patriarchal structures that existed in society and demanded equal rights in all spheres of life. Despite the progress made, there are still many challenges that need to be addressed. Some of these challenges include:

1. *Deep-rooted Patriarchy*: Patriarchy is deeply ingrained in Indian society, making it difficult for women to challenge traditional gender roles and stereotypes.

2. *Violence Against Women*: Violence against women is a pervasive problem in India. Rape, domestic violence, and sexual harassment are common occurrences, and many women are afraid to speak out against these crimes.

3. *Lack of Representation*: Women are underrepresented in politics, business, and other fields. This lack of representation makes it difficult for women to have their voices heard and their rights protected.

4. *Cultural Barriers*: India has a diverse culture with different beliefs and values. Some cultural practices may not be compatible with feminist ideals, making it difficult to promote gender equality.

5. *Economic Disempowerment*: Women in India are often economically disempowered, making it difficult for them to achieve financial independence and break free from traditional gender roles.

Over the years, the feminist movement in India has evolved to address these challenges. Feminists have started to focus on issues such as 'women's health', 'reproductive rights', and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Sarbani Guha Ghosal, 'MAJOR TRENDS OF FEMINISM IN INDIA' (2005) 66 (4) JSTOR 793-812

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> 'Logo of the Women's Indian Association' (*INDIAN CULTURE*) <<u>https://indianculture.gov.in/node/2838813</u>> accessed 7<sup>th</sup> December 2023

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> T. Editors of Encyclopaedia, 'Annie Besant. Encyclopedia Britannica' (*Encyclopedia Britannica*, 27 September 2023) <<u>https://www.britannica.com/biography/Annie-Besant</u>> accessed 7<sup>th</sup> December 2023

'economic empowerment'. They have also started to use social media and other digital platforms to raise awareness about women's issues and mobilize support for their cause.

The #MeToo movement, which gained momentum in India in 2018, was a turning point for the feminist movement. Women started to speak out against sexual harassment and assault, and many high-profile men were held accountable for their actions.

The Indian government has also taken steps to promote gender equality. The National Policy for the Empowerment of Women was introduced in 2001, which aimed to promote women's rights and empower them economically. The government has also introduced laws such as the "Sexual Harassment of Women at Workplace (Prevention, Prohibition and Redressal) Act, 2013"<sup>6</sup>, which aims to prevent sexual harassment of women at the workplace. Feminism in India has come a long way since its inception. Women have made significant progress in challenging traditional gender roles and demanding their rights. However, there are still many challenges that need to be addressed, including violence against women, lack of representation, and economic disempowerment. By continuing to raise awareness about these issues and mobilizing support for their cause, feminists in India can continue to make progress towards achieving gender equality.

## **RESTORATIVE JUSTICE IN ASSOCIATION WITH FEMINISM**

The goal of restorative justice is to make amends for the harm that criminal behaviour has caused rather than to punish offenders. Finding a remedy to the harm brought on by the crime involves the victim, the perpetrator, and the community. Because it prioritises the needs and experiences of victims, who are frequently women, and aims to address the underlying causes of violence against women, restorative justice is frequently linked to feminism. Let's explore the relationship between restorative justice and feminism, examining how restorative justice can be used to address gender-based violence and promote gender equality. Gender-based violence is a pervasive problem that affects women and girls around the world. Restorative justice offers a way to address gender-based violence that is centered on the needs and experiences of victims. It recognizes that traditional criminal justice systems often fail to provide justice for victims of gender-based violence, who may be re-victimized by a system that prioritizes punishment over healing.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> The Sexual Harassment of Women at Workplace (Prevention, Prohibition and Redressal) Act, 2013

#### **AXIS JURIS INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL**

This can involve apologies, restitution, community service, or other forms of repair. Restorative justice can be particularly effective in cases of gender-based violence. Restorative justice is often associated with feminist principles because it prioritizes the needs and experiences of victims, who are often women. Feminist principles are central to restorative justice because they recognize the impact of gender-based violence on women's lives and seek to address the root causes of violence against women.

Despite its potential benefits, restorative justice also faces challenges and criticisms when it comes to addressing gender-based violence. The risk of re-victimization is one difficulty, as victims can feel under pressure to engage in the process or might not feel confident facing their abuser. The possibility that criminals would employ restorative justice to evade punishment rather than accepting responsibility for their conduct is another difficulty. In situations of severe or recurrent assault, when punishment may be required to protect the victim and stop further injury, critics contend that restorative justice may not be appropriate. Restorative justice faces challenges and criticisms when it comes to addressing gender-based violence. It is important to continue exploring how restorative justice can be used effectively in these cases while also recognizing its limitations.

## MEDIATION AND RESISTIVE JUSTICE IN INDIA

An increasingly restorative approach to justice that tackles the underlying social and psychological issues that lead to criminal behaviour can be achieved through the employment of mediation and resistive justice in conjunction with transfer systems, governance, and feminism.

As an alternate conflict resolution method, mediation has grown in favour in India. The formation of legal services authorities at the federal, state, and local levels is outlined in "The Legal Services Authorities Act, 1987"<sup>7</sup> in order to offer the poor and other marginalised groups in society with free legal assistance. These agencies also permit the use of mediation to resolve disagreements.

Resistive justice in India has been promoted by civil society organizations, particularly those working with marginalized communities. These organizations have challenged the dominant

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> The Legal Services Authorities Act, 1987

narratives and power structures that underpin the criminal justice system and have advocated for more restorative approaches to justice.

# CHALLENGES IN IMPLEMENTING MEDIATION AND RESISTIVE JUSTICE IN INDIA

In order to successfully establish programmes for resisting justice and mediation in India, a number of issues must be resolved. The lack of financing and resources for these programmes is one of the major issues. Many of these programs are understaffed and underfunded, which limits their effectiveness in addressing the complex needs of individuals involved in the criminal justice system.

Another challenge is the lack of training and education for criminal justice professionals in mediation and resistive justice. Many criminal justice professionals are trained in traditional approaches to justice that focus on punishment and deterrence, rather than rehabilitation and restoration. This can make it difficult to effectively implement mediation and resistive justice programs.

Mediation and restorative justice are alternative dispute resolution mechanisms that have gained popularity in recent years. While these methods have been successful in many countries, implementing them in India presents unique challenges. Challenges in Implementing Mediation and Restorative Justice in India

1. *Lack of Awareness*- The lack of public knowledge is one of the main obstacles to the implementation of mediation and restorative justice in India. The advantages of these alternate conflict settlement procedures are not widely known. It is challenging to advocate for mediation and restorative justice as legitimate choices for resolving conflicts because of this ignorance.

2. *Limited Access*- Another challenge is limited access to mediation and restorative justice services. These services are not widely available, particularly in rural areas. This limits the reach of these mechanisms and makes it difficult for people to access them.

3. *Cultural Barriers*- India has a diverse culture with different beliefs and values. Some cultural practices may not be compatible with mediation and restorative justice. For example, some

communities may prefer to settle disputes through traditional methods such as panchayats (village councils), which may not be conducive to mediation or restorative justice.

4. *Legal Framework*- The legal framework for mediation and restorative justice in India is still evolving. While there are laws that provide for mediation and restorative justice, they are not comprehensive enough to cover all types of disputes. There is also a lack of clarity on the role of the courts in these mechanisms.

5. *Resistance from Lawyers*- Lawyers in India are trained to be adversarial and often resist alternative dispute resolution mechanisms such as mediation and restorative justice. They may see these mechanisms as a threat to their profession and income.

6. *Lack of Trust*- In India, there is a lack of trust in the justice system. People may not trust mediators or restorative justice practitioners to be impartial and fair. This lack of trust can make it difficult to promote these mechanisms as viable options for resolving disputes. Ways to Overcome the Challenges:

1. *Awareness Campaigns*- To overcome the lack of awareness, there is a need for awareness campaigns to promote mediation and restorative justice. These campaigns should be targeted at different sections of society, including rural communities, women, and marginalized groups.

2. *Expansion of Services*- To increase access to mediation and restorative justice services, there is a need to expand these services across the country. This can be done by training more practitioners and setting up centers in rural areas.

3. *Cultural Sensitivity*- Practitioners of restorative justice and mediation should get training in cultural sensitivity and awareness of various cultural practises. This can aid in bridging cultural divides and increase the acceptability of these techniques within various cultures.

4. *Strengthening the Legal Framework*- The legal framework for mediation and restorative justice needs to be strengthened to cover all types of disputes. The role of the courts in these mechanisms should also be clarified to avoid confusion.

#### **AXIS JURIS INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL**

5. *Collaboration with Lawyers*- Lawyers should be involved in the promotion of mediation and restorative justice. They should be trained on these mechanisms and their benefits to encourage them to support these mechanisms.

6. *Building Trust-* To build trust in mediation and restorative justice, practitioners should be trained to be impartial and fair. There should also be mechanisms in place to ensure accountability and transparency in the process.

Mediation and restorative justice are alternative dispute resolution mechanisms that have the potential to transform the justice system in India. However, implementing these mechanisms presents unique challenges. To overcome these challenges, there is a need for awareness campaigns, expansion of services, cultural sensitivity, strengthening of the legal framework, collaboration with lawyers, and building trust. By addressing these challenges, mediation and restorative justice can become viable options for resolving disputes in India.

## CONCLUSION

A comprehensive strategy that tackles the underlying social and psychological causes that lead to criminal behaviour is required to transform the criminal justice system in India. The intersection of transfer system, governance, and feminism with resistive justice in association with mediation provides a valuable framework for transforming the criminal justice system into a more equitable and just institution. However, addressing the challenges associated with implementing this approach will require a concerted effort from government agencies, civil society organizations, and other stakeholders. Together, we can change the Indian criminal justice system into a strengthens disadvantaged groups.

TERNATIO